Multimodal Depiction of Israelis and Palestinians on Gaza Conflict in Two Middle Eastern Press

Robiatul Adawiyah¹, Esti Junining², Sri Endah Tabiati³
Universitas Brawijaya¹²³
rowi.iik20@gmail.com¹, esti@ub.ac.id², stabiati@gmail.com³

Abstract
This study aims to examine how two Middle Eastern Press, Daily Sabah and Iran Daily in depicting Israeli and Palestinians on Gaza conflict. This study carries out Multimodal Critical Discourse Analysis to uncover ideology of media. In other words, it focuses not only on the linguistic features but also semiotic resources realized through images. It analyses clauses that contain Van Dijk’s ideological square discourse using transitivitgy by Halliday (2004) and images existed in the selected articles using representational function of image by Kress & van Leeuwen (2006). The results show that both media represented Palestinians as Self-group whereas Israelis as Other-group. They portrayed the Self as the victims and right fighter in contrast to the Other as the agent of offensiveness.

Keywords: Gaza conflict, multimodal critical discourse analysis, representational function of image, transitivity

I. INTRODUCTION
A multimodal critical discourse analysis is a new trend in linguistics that emerges as a combination of two distinct fields of applied linguistics, called as critical discourse analysis
and multimodality (van Leeuwen 2013). It is the complement in critical discourse studies which investigates two modes’ meaning-making potential, language and semiotic resources, to reveal the kinds of power relations and ideologies buried in the text (Ledin & Machin, 2018). This kind of analysis study becomes fundamental since the semiotic resources are also used to make situated meaning, ideologies, and values. As Kress & van Leeuwen (2006) explained in detail, the role of images in text is as important as lexical choices because images also carry ideological representations. It may describe why the news writers insert the images in their articles. It can be explained that the role of verbal and visual elements existed in the text cannot be separated in understanding the meaning of the text itself.

Several linguistic studies on multimodal critical discourse analysis had been carried out to uncover the power or ideology, such as in Sunarto et al. (2019) research. Their findings showed the shots and the utterances represented the power and domination by the characters of the movie. The power was done by the dominant group who has more members, facilities, connection and higher status to control over powerless people who has no status. The power could be exercise through violence, status, money and etc. For the needs of multimodal understanding, the multimodal studies did not stop at movie analysis. It had also extended to political issue in news article. One of previous studies was undertaken by Al Sawi (2015) that aimed to explore Egyptian newspaper front-page in representing Egyptian President. Both research concluded that multimodal analysis is able to show the ideological stance.

Based on those reasons, the present study also conducts the multimodal critical discourse analysis to examine how Middle Eastern newspapers depict the Israeli and Palestinians on Gaza conflict.

The Israeli-Palestinian conflict which has run for decades is regarded as the world’s longest conflict (www.vox.com). The dispute over the land, known as Gaza, is the heart of the conflict. Initially, Israel had withdrawn their occupation from Gaza after 1994 declared in a peace agreement and gave a part of their authorities to Palestine. The agreement did not last long after the Palestinian election of 2006 because Palestinians refused to recognize the Israel’s power (Rababah & Hamdan, 2019). It finally arose the tensions between Israeli and Palestinians. Israel blocked Gaza strips and began launching the attack. This case successfully attracts news media around the world. The news that cover the Israeli-Palestinian conflict has increased dramatically. Each news company also has different ways and stance in reporting the issue.
Due to this difference, a number of CDA studies are interested in examining this ongoing conflict. They have investigated the Gaza conflict with different cultural contexts, such as American press (Almeida, 2011; Saariaho, 2015), Britain press (Wang, 2017), British and American press (Amer, 2017), and Palestinian and Israeli press (Qawariq, 2016). Moreover, Rababah and Hamdan’s (2019) study also investigated the Gaza conflict from Netahayu’s and Abbas’s speeches. The findings of those studies pointed out that the Israeli and Palestinians were framed in binary fashion, whether positive and negative. Unfortunately, those previous studies had neglected the visual element of the newspapers. They only gave more attention to the verbal analysis of text.

Differently, the present study conducts the multimodal critical discourse analysis which focuses on the verbal and visual analysis of text to examine how two Middle Eastern newspapers depict the Israeli and Palestinians on Gaza conflict. Those two newspapers are Daily Sabah from Turkey and Iran Daily from Iran. The reason of this selection is to know whether the different political ideologies influence the news production. Furthermore, this study employs Multimodal Critical Discourse Analysis as general framework. It uses transitivity as verbal analytical tool and representational function of image as visual analytical tool to examine how Middle Eastern press embody their ideology, in accordance with positive self-presentation and negative other-presentation, in portraying the Palestinians on Gaza conflict. Hence, this study is performed to investigate about; (1) how are positive self-presentation and negative other-presentation of Israeli and Palestinian on Gaza conflict in two Middle Eastern newspapers depicted through the choices of transitivity and representational function of images?; (2) how do those choices express the ideology of both media, in line with positive self-presentation and negative self-presentation?.

The present study utilizes critical approach to uncover the ideology of the media. Critical is one of appropriate methods for analysing the media discourse, especially (Cotter in Schiffrin et al., 2001). With regard to the role of language, Critical Discourse Analysis gives an insight into the way power abuse, dominance, and inequality reproduced by the text and talk in the social and political context (van Dijk, 2009). In other words, CDA describes the relationships between language, power, society, ideology and politics.

Van Dijk’s CDA framework focuses on the cognitive dimension of language use and social practices. For him, cognition is the main element of people that ideologically drives their discourse productions, and therefore control social practices (van Dijk, 2009). There are some strategies that are commonly employed to the ideological discourses. These
strategies are called the “Ideological Square” of positive self-presentation and negative self-presentation. It explains that each ideological discourse tends to emphasize their positiveness and their own group; in the same way it focuses on highlighting the negativeness of other group. It can be influenced by their nations, parties, ideologies, so forth. This kind of strategy is observable across all linguistic dimensions of a text from the linguistic (e.g. lexicons and syntactic structures) and non-linguistic resource (e.g. images and signs) appeared in the text.

The analysis in van Dijk’s model differentiated between macro and micro level of analysis. Firstly, the macro-analysis of news discourse examines the focal point of this model which involves thematic structure to make explicit the notion of themes of discourse or the global meaning of discourse. Secondly, the micro-analysis focuses on the analysis of linguistic resource, such as syntactic, lexical and other rhetorical elements that provide coherence in texts. Additionally, it may involve the semiotic or non-linguistic resources, including pictures, photographs, movies, and signs because it typically express the ideology of the discourse-maker (van Dijk, 1995). This analysis step successfully exposes the ideological strategy which emphasizes Self good actions and de-emphasizes Self-bad ones. Based on the brief explanation about CDA, it can be summed up that CDA is able to reveal the hidden ideology laid in the text through the verbal and visual resources.

A number of studies has shared the use of Systematic Functional Grammar (SFG) developed by Halliday in Critical Discourse Analysis or even in Multimodal Critical Discourse. SFG serves a powerful tool for textual linguistic analysis (Rababah & Hamdan, 2019). It views language as choices of language users that cannot be separated with social and cultural contexts. A language performs three meta functions, namely ideational, interpersonal, and textual (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2004). However, this present study merely focuses on the verbal analysis based on the ideational function realized by transitivity structure. Transitivity describes a clause as a representation of the world. It denotes the experiences of the language users towards the world around them. Mayr (2008) states that transitivity is used as a tool to explore what social, cultural, ideological and political factors determine what Process type (verb) is chosen in a particular type of discourse. In transitivity analysis, a clause is divided into process (verbs), participants (subjects and objects), and circumstances (additional information associated with the process, such as time, place, and so forth).

Furthermore, there are six types of process (material, mental, relational, behavioural...
verbal, and existential) differentiated by the use of verbs. (1) Material process refers to process of acting or performing things (e.g. make, go, write) equipped with Actor and Goal as participants. (2) Mental Process belongs to the process of thinking, feeling and perceiving (e.g. see, think, feel and want) with the participants a Senser (a person who senses) and a phenomenon (what is sensed). (3) Relational Process shows the process of ‘being’ or having. The participants are separated into two types: Identifying (e.g. Sarah is the most beautiful person) with an Identified and an Identifier for labelling the participants and Attributive (e.g. Sarah is beautiful) with participants’ label as a Carrier and an Attribute. (4) Behavioural Process refers to the process of psychological behavior (e.g. ‘breath’, ‘cry’, ‘stare’, ‘dream’). The participants are labelled as behaver (subject) and behavior (object). (5) Verbal Process performs the process of ‘saying’ (e.g. ‘say’, ‘claim’, describe) that involves a Sayer and a Receiver. (6) Existential Process presents the process of existing that is mostly indicated by the use of the introductory word ‘there’ (e.g. There was a boy therefor only one participant that is labelled as an Existent (‘a boy’).

In line with the verbal analysis, this study also utilizes the visual analysis based on the representational function of image in order to reveal the experiential meaning and the message of image (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2004). In other words, representational function focused on the actions of participants existed in the image. Moreover, it is realized by two types of images, namely narrative image (unfolding or unstable objects) and conceptual image (stable or timeless objects).

Narrative images commonly contains of action process and reactional process whereas conceptual images includes classification, analytical process, and symbolic process (Liu 2013 in Manca, 2016). Each type is also divided into some categories according to the role of the participants appeared in the image. Narrative analysis involves the action process and reactional process. Action process comprises three elements that should not be neglected. They are an actor of the image that refers to the participant who does the action, a vector that connects participants and represents them doing something, and a goal belongs to something at which a vector is aimed. For instance, in an image of a couple are walking with holding hands (Manca, 2016). It can be identified that the man is the actor, the woman is the goal, and their arms, legs, and gazes are the vector. Narrative image is considered as reactional when the vector is formed solely by an eyeline of the participants. Here, the participants that bring out the vector are reactors and the other participants at which or whom the vector are phenomena.
Moreover, the participants in conceptual images are described based on their class, structure or meaning. Classificational process is determined as subordinate to other participants. The analytical process involves part (possessive attribute) and whole (carrier) structure of participants. The last is the symbolic process which is intended with the meaning created by the participants.

II. RESEARCH METHOD

This study adopts the qualitative approach which involves primary and secondary data sources. The primary data are clauses of selected articles that contain discourse strategy of positive self-presentation and negative other-presentation and all images existed in selected articles; the secondary data are eight news articles with Israeli-Palestinian conflict topic collected from two Middle Eastern Press, Daily Sabah and Iran Daily, within August 2019. They are downloaded from the online newspapers websites. Only articles that focus on Israeli attack to Palestinians are then selected as data source.

Following the van Dijk’s framework combined with transitivity and representational function of image, the current study provides a textual analysis focusing not only on the written text but also semiotic resources realized through image. The methodology carries out the micro (local semantics) and macro (culture and society) levels analysis. In micro level, the selected clauses are inserted in transitivity analysis to identify the types of processes and participants of each clause. Furthermore, the images are subjected to representational function analysis. Each verbal and visual analysis result are interpreted based on the context. The analysis also highlights the predominant process types (material, mental, verbal, relational, and existential) and predominant representational function of image. In macro level, these results are examined with social context to reveal how ideology of two newspapers companies is represented in depicting the positive self-presentation and negative other-presentation.

III. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

The analysis of study includes the verbal and visual analysis of text. In verbal analysis, only four process types (material, mental, relational, and verbal process) existed in eight articles (3 from Daily Sabah and 5 from Iran Daily). The material process (verbs of acting) sits in the first stage of other process types with the total of 64 processes. Around 52
processes belong to Israeli as the actor of the action and Palestinian as its goal. Those processes mostly have negative sense which demonstrates the negative other-presentation.

The verbal process (verbs of saying) as the second stage draw Israeli and Palestinians as the sayer of the process however this process respectively describes the negative other-presentation and positive self-presentation. As the same token with material process, the mental process (verbs of feeling/affection/wants) used in the articles has negative sense of Israeli wants. It also describes the negative other-presentation. On the contrary, the relational process (verbs of attributes/having) is utilized only to portray the negative other-presentation.

**Chart 1.**
The Result of Transitivity Analysis

In visual analysis, there are eight images found in the selected articles. Based on the representational function, seven images utilize the narrative process, and the rest uses the conceptual process. The narrative process is predominantly employed to describe the action of Palestinians. It represents Palestinians as the actors who fight for their rights, and victims of the conflict. In contrast, it also shows Israelis’ action referring the negative sense toward Palestinians. Furthermore, the conceptual process is only used to depict the inanimate objects that refer to the shattered building and the army trucks. The shattered building becomes the Superordinate which represents viewers’ perception (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006). In other words, those images are displayed in the news articles to encode negative other-presentation.

From those analysis, both media expose all that is positive about the Palestinian represented as Self-group and all that negative about Israeli represented as Other-group. The clauses in selected news mostly focus on the role of Palestinians as victims of Israeli attacks
and the action of Palestinians to defend their rights taken by Israeli. Accordingly, the analysis results falls into two categories, namely (1) offensiveness and victimization, and (2) self-defence. These categories are conducted based on the topic permeating the discourse of news articles.

The news media emphasizes the offences of Israeli and sufferings of the Palestinian people caused by the conflict. Almost all the statements in the news media describe the negative action of Israeli government and the challenges the Palestinian face. Here, the news media highlight the negative deeds of Other-group and foreground the Self-group as victims of the conflict. There are some examples of verbal and visual analysis demonstrating the Palestinian victimization.

- Verbal Analysis

Datum 1

“Israeli forces shot dead four Palestinians near a security fence at the Gaza Strip border, according to the army on Saturday.” (Daily Sabah, 10/8/2019)

Datum 2

“at least one other Palestinian had suffered critical injuries in the overnight attack” (Iran Daily, 18/8/2019)

Datum 1 and 2 refer to the material clauses which utilize ‘shot’ and ‘suffered’ for the material process of doing. The doers between datum 1 and datum 2 are different. In datum 1, Israeli forces are the actor and four Palestinians are the goal. It describes that Israeli is presented as active agent of murdering Palestinians. On the other hand, Palestinians in datum 2 also become the actors who physically experience with injuries that implicitly direct to Israeli. The use of those processes which have negative sense is the way of media to depict Palestinian as the victims of the incident.

Datum 3

“Israel was ‘fueling religious tensions in Jerusalem’,” (Daily Sabah, 11/8/2019)

This clause uses the mental process ‘fueling’ which belongs to the process of perceiving. It indicates Israel is perceived as the agent of the tensions. This clause shows how media represent the negative role of Israeli. The news media point out
that the tensions which causes many casualties in Jerusalem are triggered by Israeli. This statement is continued with the statement in Datum 4.

Datum 4

“Israel officials are fully responsible for its grave consequences.”  
*Daily Sabah, 11/8/2019*

This clause is used to support the preceding statement. It employs the relational process ‘are’ to encode relationships of being and having and often used in discourse presenting ‘facts’ as they suggest a certain certainty (Butt et al., 2003). The news media bluntly give an attribute ‘responsible’ to Israel officials. They insist and blame Israel officials for the bad consequences faced by the Palestinians.

Datum 5

“The Israeli government has repeatedly said it has no intention of changing the status quo.”  
*Daily Sabah, 11/8/2019*

Datum 5 actually consists of two clauses. However, its main clause refers to the use of verbal process ‘has repeatedly said’. This clause expresses the negative deed of Israeli government towards Palestinians. The following clause encode that Israeli government never change their mind to take over the site of Palestine with ignoring Palestinian condition.

- **Visual Analysis**

Datum 6

**Figure 1**

*Iran Daily 23/8/2019*

Figure 1 depicts a group of people is busy for helping the man who carry the injured boy. It belongs to reactional process in which the vector is formed by the direction
of the glance of represented participants (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006). The participants are a group people as the reactors and the injured boy as the phenomenon. They react to their action with gripping hands and worried faces towards the phenomenon. The picture signifies the unity of Palestinian and their challenge caused by Israeli forces. Contextually, this picture is used by news media to emphasize that Palestinian are the victims. Furthermore, the news media implicitly induce their viewers to feel what the Palestinian feel.

Datum 7
Figure 2
Daily Sabah 11/8/2019

Another picture that indicates victimization is shown in Figure 2. This picture contains the action process of Israeli police. It includes the police as the actor, the Palestinian as the goal of action, and the extended hands with holding the gun is the vector. This structure refers to a transactional action process in which the police together have the role of ‘Actor’ (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006). The picture explains that the police as shooter who are shooting the Muslim worshippers or Palestinian in front of the mosque in order not to enter the mosque. It implies that news media represent the Palestinian as victims of the conflict whereas Israelis as the perpetrators.

3.1 Self-defence

Another topic permeating the discourse of news media is the self-defence of Palestinian towards Israeli. The media emphasize the action Palestinian in defending their rights.

Verbal Analysis
Datum 8

“Several dozen entered the site under close police escort and Muslim
worshippers began throwing chairs and other objects at the group.” (Daily Sabah, 11/8/2019)

The first clause that indicates the self-defence of Palestinian is described in the second clause of datum 8. It employs the material process ‘began throwing’ that involve the actor ‘Muslim worshippers’ of Palestinian and the goal ‘the chairs and other objects’. The clause explains that the Palestinian protest to the Israeli police because of their unfair treatment which is elaborated in the previous clause. The unfair treatment is shown by the act of Israeli police in treating the community. The Israeli citizen are allowed to enter the mosque under the police escort whereas Palestinian or Moslem worshippers are forbidden. This case is claimed as the cause of the disruption. The news media emphasize that Palestinian take those action, throwing the chairs at the police, because they fight to defend their right.

Datum 9

“Palestinians want the West Bank as part of their future independent state with East Jerusalem al-Quds as its capital.” (Iran Daily, 25/8/2019)

The clause in datum 9 refers to the mental clause which involves the process ‘want’. The meaning of the phrase ‘to want’ is ‘to need’ for something (Cambridge dictionary). Based on the clause above, the something describes the West Bank that is one of Palestinian territory occupied by Israel from 1967. The use of mental process indicates the perception of the writers. It demonstrates that the media wants to show the perception of Palestinians towards the West Bank. For Palestinians, West Bank is part of their future so they need and reclaim it. They want to be free from Israel that is indicated by employing the phrase ‘East Jerusalem al-Quds as its capital’.

Datum 10

“The Palestinians demand the right to return of those driven out of their homeland by Israeli aggression.” (Iran Daily, 1/8/2019)

In datum 10, the clause employs the verbal process ‘demand’ with ‘Palestinians’ as the sayer and ‘the right to…’ as the verbiage that functions to correspond to what is
said in the clause. The verbal process is used to indicate the process of asking. Semantically, the verbal process ‘demand’ means to ask for something forcefully. This clause explains that Palestinians ask their right forcefully. They insist Israeli government to return their homeland.

- **Visual Analysis**

  Datum 11

  **Figure 3**

  *Daily Sabah 16/8/2019*

  Figure 3 shows the transactional action process of Palestinians. From the picture, a group Palestinians are determined as the actors and the Palestinian flags are the goals. The angle of hands that is holding the flag form a strong vector. The action happens out near the fence along the border with Israel in the eastern Gaza Strip. It describes that they hold a demonstration to Israeli. Demonstration is an action to show their disagreement towards Israeli. By raising the flags, they proclaim that Palestine also has right to be free.

  The results demonstrate that media attempt to depict Israelis and Palestinian differently through the choice of transitivity and images. In transitivity analysis, this study Wang's (2017) research that the negative actions are framed in binary fashions, Self and Other. The media mostly use negative material process to depict the case however those process have different functions based on the agent of the action. The negative actions used by Self-group that refers to Palestinians (in Datum 8) aims to show the action of self-defence by legitimizing their action whereas the ones used by Other-group that belongs to Israelis function to depict the offensiveness. The media also represent Palestinians as agent of victimization while Israelis as initiator of violent action. Therefore, this result attempts to add Rababah & Hamdan (2019) statement that the active agent in material process is used to
determine Self-group not only as agent of self-defence but also as agent of victimization. Here, it can be proved that transitivity is able to show the writers’ point of view (Fowler, 1991).

Similarly, the visual analysis result express Palestinians as participants of victimization and Israelis as participants of offensiveness. The media mainly use narrative process, either action or reactional, to show the action of participants. The result shows that the media emphasize in representing the affliction and struggle of Palestinians in Gaza conflict, and the aggression of Israelis. It indirectly demonstrates the stance of the media in depicting two groups. The media emphasizes to depict Palestinians as victims of the conflict. In line with Saariaho (2015), this study believes that the victimization of Self-group is one of writers’ strategy to evoke the readers’ sympathy. Moreover, it also agrees with Kress & van Leeuwen’s (2006) statement that the images become means to articulate the ideological position. In other words, the employment of images or visual text in news article is not without reason however it contains the writers’ ideology. It is one of strategies owned by the writers to deliver meaning and share their belief.

From the result, it describes that the depiction of Israelis and Palestinians in news media are not equal and neutral. It is line with Nurhayati (2014) that the fact reported by media is not objective but the fact that is constructed by individual or institution. Moreover, the information produced by the media is also limited (Muqoffa, 2020) because it is selected based on their point of view and stance. Thus, it is also necessary to find out the motives of media in using their power abuse to frame the role of Self group. Daily Sabah and Iran Daily are two well-known English-language Middle Eastern Press. Daily Sabah is the Turkish top daily published in Turkey whereas Iran Daily is published in Iran. Turkey and Iran are considered as Islamic countries which have Muslims as the most population. It can be said that the readers of the newspapers are predominantly Muslim people that is similar with Palestine. Muslims in Palestine comprise 85 percent of population. In other words, Turkish and Iranian people definitely support Palestinian rather than Israeli because of their beliefs. Therefore, the media are demanded to report news based on the readers’ belief. According to Fowler (1991), this kind of social relations is one of factors that determine the output and activities of media. They prefer to report the positive representation of Palestinian and negative representation of Israeli.

In addition, those newspapers are owned and organized by their governments. Daily Sabah is owned by a friend of Turkish President Erdogan whereas Iran Daily is owned by
The Islamic Republic New Agency (IRNA) of Iran. It even describe themselves as pro-government daily or propaganda outlets for their governments. It means they always support the policies of the governments. In political issue, their relations, Turkey and Iran, with Israel have been steadily deteriorating. With regard to Gaza conflict, both countries consequently always support Palestine rather than Israeli. The external relations of the media with other industries and with official agencies become another factor that influence the stance of media in reporting the news (Fowler, 1991). Accordingly, this findings support Amer's (2017) research that news reports are influenced by political orientations of newspapers and the ideological stances. The distance of media to social structures decides much of their discursive tendencies in producing the text (Qawariq, 2016). The closer the media are to social structures, the more they depend on representing actions and actors from Self-group or Other-group; whereas the further they are from social structures, the more they focus on representing extensive context to produce different realities.

IV. CONCLUSION

This present study provides a multimodal critical discourse analysis of Daily Sabah and Iran Daily newspapers in reporting Israelis and Palestinians on Gaza conflict. By integrating van Dijk’s framework of CDA, transitivity, and representational function of image, the results reveals that media portray Self-group that refers to Palestinians as victims and right fighters in contrast to Other-group that belongs to Israelis as the initiators of violent. The verbal analysis in transitivity structure and the visual analysis in representational process demonstrate the ideological positions of the writers indicating the strategy of positive-self presentation and negative-other presentation. It can be concluded that this discursive practices is much influenced by the political and ideological landscape of the media. Therefore, the aim of this study is to raise the readers’ awareness that what they read and see does not merely represent the truth but there are some considerations that control the news production. The readers are asked to read critically to get the reliable information. Furthermore, it has to be acknowledged that the data of present study are limited and it is interesting to continue this study in case the Gaza conflict sees no end in the near future. The next researchers could conduct further study by using more various media from other countries and by implementing other frameworks, such as Fowler’s framework or Wodak’s framework.
REFERENCES


